

Appendix D (ii)

This page is left Blank.

**RHONDDA CYNON TAF COUNTY BOROUGH COUNCIL
OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY PROCEDURE RULES – RULE 17
SCRUTINY CALL IN FORM**

THIS FORM MUST:

- (A) BE SIGNED BY AT LEAST THREE MEMBERS FROM AT LEAST TWO DIFFERENT POLITICAL GROUPS (or in the case of an unallocated member(s) that unallocated member(s) and a member(s) from a political group).
- (B) BE EMAILED TO C. HANAGAN, SERVICE DIRECTOR DEMOCRATIC SERVICES & COMMUNICATIONS TO THE FOLLOWING ADDRESS – scrutiny@rctcbc.gov.uk OR HAND DELIVERED TO THE PAVILIONS, CAMBRIAN PARK, CLYDACH VALE, CF40 2XX WITHIN THE TIMESCALE NOTIFIED WITHIN THE CONSTITUTION

DETAILS OF DECISION

Decision of Cabinet/Cabinet Member/Other (Please delete as appropriate)

Date of Publication of decision: 18th July 2019.....

Subject of Decision 21ST CENTURY SCHOOLS PROGRAMME-PROPOSALS TO IMPROVE EDUCATION PROVISION IN THE GREATER PONTYPRIDD AREA.....

Decision Called in (Please quote from the record of decision)

1. To note the information contained within the Objection Report in Appendix A of the report, which includes a summary of the 435 objections received during the statutory notice period, and the comments provided in response to the objections and Appendices B-D being the Community, Equality and Welsh Language Impact Assessments. 2. To implement the proposals as published in three of the Statutory Notices which would: •Close Pontypridd High School and Cilfynydd Primary School and create a new 3 –16 ‘all through’ school on the site of the current Pontypridd High School by September 2022. There will be no sixth form provision at this school; •Close Hawthorn High School and Hawthorn Primary School and create a new 3 – 16 ‘all through’ school on the site of the current Hawthorn High and Hawthorn Primary Schools by September 2022, with the Local Authority designated ALN specialist class located in Hawthorn High School, as well as the current pupils receiving education through the medium of English at Heol y Celyn Primary School, transferring to the new school. There will be no sixth form provision at this school; •Close Ysgol Gynradd Gymraeg Pont Sion Norton and Heol y Celyn Primary School and open a new Welsh medium primary school on the site of the current Heol y Celyn Primary School by September 2022. 3. The associated catchment changes detailed in the explanatory notes to the Statutory Notices - such catchment changes becoming effective from 1st September 2022. This excludes the proposed change to the catchment area of Bryncelynnog Comprehensive School as agreed by Cabinet on 21st March 2019 which was not included within the Statutory Notices. 4. To note that as previously reported, the School Organisation Code makes provision for local authorities to determine their own statutory proposals, with the exception of the proposal relating to Cardinal Newman RC Comprehensive School. The Cardinal

Newman RC Comprehensive School proposal relates only to the removal of the sixth form, the implementation (or non-implementation) of which will not prevent or undermine the effective implementation of the other proposals. In accordance with the School Organisation Code this has been referred to Welsh Ministers for determination.5. To note that a separate report on funding arrangements would be presented to Council in due course which would also be subject to approval by Welsh Government.

6.To note that following the decision to proceed with the proposal to construct a new Welsh medium primary, a separate report to establish a new ALN learning support class at the new Welsh medium school would be presented in due course.

Reason for calling in decision (Please use separate sheet if necessary)		
Please see separate sheet below.		
Names	Signature	Group
Stephen Belzak	S Belzak	Unallocated
Lewis Hooper	L Hooper	Conservative
Eleri Megan Griffiths	E.M Griffiths	Plaid Cymru

Date: ...23rd July 2019

For Office use only by the Service Director, Democratic Services & Communication

Date & Time of Receipt: 23/7/19 13:03 ... Officer Receiving: E. Walker

Accepted as a valid Call-in:
To be submitted to the Overview & Scrutiny Committee.

Signature:  Date: 24/7/19

Reason for calling in decision:

The Cabinet failed to adequately discharge its duties under the provisions of the Welfare of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015, as evidenced by:

1. Its failure, in deciding to close Cilfynydd Primary School and move its pupils to the site of Pontypridd High School, to consider adequately or at all, the extensive scientific literature drawing attention to the short term and long term adverse health outcomes (including, but not limited to, asthma, heart disease, psychosis and reduced cognition) faced by persons spending a considerable proportion of their day in close proximity to a busy and heavily polluted road such as the A470. Cabinet has also failed to note the apparent incongruity between the relaxed approach of current authority policy (based on *current* domestic guidelines and legislative framework) on

the one hand, and the concern expressed by other public health professionals and by much of the journal literature on the other hand. This latter point is exemplified by such matters as:

(a) The head of the World Health Organisation has referred to air pollution as affecting the majority of the globe's inhabitants and has described the situation as a "silent public health emergency."

(b) Findings in the peer-reviewed journal literature to the effect that persons living or spending significant amounts of their time within 200 metres of busy highways are at significant risk of adverse health consequences (see, for example the findings of Brugge, Durant and Rioux in 2007: "Near-highway pollutants in motor vehicle exhaust: A review of epidemiologic evidence of cardiac and pulmonary health risks").

(c) The publication of a significant study by Maher et al in June 2019 ("Combustion and friction-derived magnetic air pollution nanoparticles in human hearts") showing that large numbers of people in urban areas are suffering from inhalation of billions of toxic nano-particles from air pollution, possibly affecting every single organ in the human body, and right down to the sub-cellular level, and that persons as young as three years of age are showing signs of such deadly exposure.

(d) The disregard in current policies as regards human health of carbon dioxide, rightly identified as a greenhouse gas, but not widely recognised outside the journal literature as posing a risk to human cognition at levels exceeding 600 parts per million.

2. Its failure to justify adequately or at all the decision to close Cilfynydd primary School in order to create a single "all-through" school for 3 to 16 year-olds at Pontypridd High. Such failure is evidenced by (among other things) the fact that the Cabinet were unable to refer to any independent evidence from the academic literature to show that such all-through schools are a better model than the current model of primary and secondary schools, despite such all-through schools existing in the various nations of the United Kingdom for a number of years.

3. Its failure to consider adequately or at all its obligations arising from the commitment of the United Kingdom and other governments to the goals of the Paris 2015 Climate Accord, and the dire warnings of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change of 8th October 2018 to the effect that humanity has, at best, until 2030, to change its ways and reduce carbon dioxide emissions. This has been confirmed at a domestic political level by the declarations of climate emergency at Cardiff Bay and at Westminster. Regrettably, no better example of a head-in-the-sand attitude and a "business-as-usual" approach is afforded than by the Cabinet's decision to approve a plan which will increase road traffic and therefore carbon dioxide emissions. Such an increase will occur by virtue of:

(a) Greater distances to travel to school on foot by younger pupils in villages like Cilfynydd, making travel by car more likely, especially during bad weather;

(b) Greater distances to travel to school by road by virtue of the decision to abolish Sixth Form education provision at Pontypridd High School, Hawthorn High School, and at Cardinal Newman.

4. The failure of the Cabinet to consider adequately or at all whether school attendance might reasonably be expected to be adversely affected by a combination of longer distances to travel and inclement weather.